



# The National Standard

BULLETIN OF THE VEXILLOLOGICAL ASSOCIATION OF THE STATE OF TEXAS

NUMBER SIX  
SPRING-SUMMER  
2014



**THE LADY AND THE FLAG:** Ann W. Richards, then governor, at the Democratic National Convention in New York City, July 1992. *A.P./Joe Marquette.*

## REPORT ON THE DESIGN OF THE LONE STAR FLAG BY THE TEXAS VEXILLOLOGICAL COMMISSION

For the Lone Star Flag’s 150th anniversary in 1989, both the House of Representatives and Senate passed House Concurrent Resolution 9 (71st Legislature, Regular Session, 1989 *Texas General and Special Laws*, page 6268), [1] which stated, “This beautiful symbol of our state was designed by Dr. Charles B. Stewart, the second signer of the Texas Declaration of Independence; the design was first approved by a committee of prominent Texans including Lorenzo de Zavala, William B. Scates, Thomas Barnett, Sterling C. Robertson, Thomas J. Gazley, and Richard Ellis; and . . . the Lone Star Flag was officially adopted by the Third Congress of the Republic of Texas in Houston on January 25, 1839.”

In 1992 the Legislature changed its mind after reviewing the historical record. The House of Representatives and Senate passed, and Governor Ann Richards signed, House Concurrent Resolution 9 (72nd Legislature, Fourth Called Session, 1992 *Texas General and Special Laws*, page 24), [2] which declared that because “subsequent historical research has revealed that the actual designer of the Lone Star Flag is unknown,” the legislature would instead “recognize Senator William H. Wharton and Senator Oliver Jones for their efforts in adopting this abiding symbol of our state’s unity.” The Legislature recognized that a committee consisting of Lorenzo de Zavala, William B. Scates, Thomas Barnett, Sterling C. Robertson, Thomas J. Gazley, and Richard Ellis was appointed in March 1836 by the General Convention at Washington-on-the-Brazos to design a national flag for the newly independent Republic of Texas, but the General Convention apparently never adopted a national flag, and the 1836 committee

### CONTENTS

Note .....3  
Correspondence.....4

## COMMISSION'S REPORT: THERE IS "NO PRIMARY HISTORICAL EVIDENCE" FOR THE STEWART CLAIM

did not review the Lone Star Flag adopted in 1839. Because the 1992 concurrent resolution acknowledged that no one knows who designed the Lone Star flag, the 1989 recognition of Dr. Stewart as the "designer of the Lone Star flag" was erroneous.

Five years later, House Concurrent Resolution 19 (75th Legislature, Regular Session)[3] was filed, recognizing Stewart as the Lone Star flag's designer without any reference to the 1992 concurrent resolution. It also stated that the Lone Star Flag's design was "approval by a committee of six signers of the Texas Declaration of Independence," the same error from the 1989 concurrent resolution that was corrected in the 1992 concurrent resolution. House Concurrent Resolution 19 was withdrawn by the author on March 20, 1997,[4] due to the conflict with the 1992 concurrent resolution, but the identical text was refiled by the same author as House Resolution 1123 on May 26, 1997. House Resolution 1123 [5] was adopted by the House of Representatives on May 30, days before the session adjourned on June 2. [6] As a simple resolution, it was not considered by the Senate and did not require approval by the Governor.

No primary historical evidence has yet been brought forth to support the claim that the Lone Star Flag was designed by Charles B. Stewart. In her 1898 article "The History and Evolution of the Texas Flag," Adele Looscan is clearly skeptical that the March 1836 general convention adopted a flag, and she does not mention Stewart at all in connection with the Lone Star Flag. The Stewart claim appears to have originated in the 1920s, when Stewart's son, Edmund B. Stewart, began publicly displaying what he claimed was her father's original drawing of the 1839 Lone Star Flag and the national great seal. In a July 7, 1922 letter, Stewart's son claimed his father and Lorenzo de Zavala were appointed by President Lamar to a committee of three to design the Texas flag. Zavala, however, died in November 1836, two years before Lamar became president. Furthermore, the committee of three is doubtless the 1838–1839 Senate committee of which Senator Oliver Jones was the chair. Lamar, as President, would have had no role in appointing a Senate committee, and it would have been highly unusual for Stewart to serve on the committee since he was not a senator.

The chief source of the Stewart claim is in Mamie Wynne Cox's 1936 book, *The Romantic Flags of Texas*. Cox, relying on information from Stewart's granddaughter, Elizabeth Stewart Fling, identifies the three members of the 1838–1839 Senate committee as Senator William H. Wharton, Senator Oliver Jones, and Stewart. Cox states that Stewart personally designed the flag and drew the original art for both the flag and seal on linen, which was signed by President Lamar on January 25, 1839, the day Lamar approved the flag bill. Although Stewart's papers were available, Cox does not cite to any of Stewart's letters or journals to support the claim that he designed the flag.

The Stewart art for the 1839 flag and seal is reproduced as the frontispiece to Cox's book. The Stewart art displays the flag and seal almost identical to the Krag art. The approval of President Lamar is also almost identical to the Krag art, including the fact that Lamar's writing is upside down. One significant difference is that the signatures of Representative Hansford and Senator Burnett are absent from the Stewart art. In their place is the legend, "Original Flag—Republic of Texas."

**THE NATIONAL STANDARD** (Continuing VAST News) (ISSN 2165-0101 (Print); ISSN 2165-011X (Online)) is published twice each year by the Vexillological Association of the State of Texas, member of the Fédération internationale des associations vexillologiques. For questions or information, contact: VAST, 504 Branard Street, Houston, Texas 77006-5018 USA. E-mail: [info@texflags.org](mailto:info@texflags.org) Internet: [www.texflags.org](http://www.texflags.org)

**VEXILLOLOGICAL ASSOCIATION OF THE STATE OF TEXAS**

**JAMES T. LISTON** President | **HUGH L. BRADY** FF Vice President | **CHARLES A. SPAIN** wsf Secretary-Treasurer

The Stewart claim next appears in Charles E. Gilbert, Jr.'s 1964 book, *A Concise History of Early Texas 1519 to 1861*. Gilbert relies largely on Cox for his research, but adds the claim that Stewart's design for the Lone Star Flag was approved by a committee consisting of Lorenzo de Zavala, William B. Scates, Thomas Barnett, Sterling C. Robertson, Thomas J. Gazley, and Richard Ellis. This committee was the 1836 flag committee present at Washington-on-the-Brazos. Although Stewart was a member of the 1836 convention, Gilbert does not suggest that Stewart was an active participant in the convention's flag debates. Gilbert's book was republished in 1989 under the title *Flags of Texas*.

Due to the influence of Cox's and Gilbert's books, several other works have credited the Stewart claim in passing. A recent reference to the Stewart claim is made in his bibliographic entry in *The New Handbook of Texas* (1996), which was written by Virginia Stewart Lindley Ford. Stewart's original entry in *The Handbook of Texas* (1952) did not refer to his designing the Lone Star Flag.

After reviewing the existing historical records, the Commission finds that no primary evidence has been brought forth to substantiate the claim that the Lone Star Flag was designed by Charles B. Stewart. Until any such evidence is discovered, the Commission concludes that House Concurrent Resolution 9 of the 72nd Legislature, Fourth Called Session, correctly declared that "subsequent historical research has revealed that the actual designer of the Lone Star Flag is unknown." This resolution, passed by both the House of Representatives and Senate and approved by the Governor, constitutes the opinion of the full Legislature, not the 1997 simple resolution, which was introduced only after the author abandoned an attempt to pass the identical text in a concurrent resolution.

**H.P. "Pete" Van de Putte** (San Antonio)  
**Hugh L. Brady** (Austin)  
**David Ott** (Beaumont)  
**Charles A. Spain** (Houston)

*Adopted and filed May 4, 2013*

[1] <http://texashistory.unt.edu/ark:/67531/metaph221813/m1/1186/?q=6268>

[2] <http://texashistory.unt.edu/ark:/67531/metaph221818/m1/280/>

[3] <https://perma.cc/A3DF-RZHF>

[4] <https://perma.cc/864Y-TXFW>

[5] <https://perma.cc/X2FK-P2YB>

[6] <https://perma.cc/EGH2-6DAD>

## **NOTE ON THE TEXAS VEXILLOLOGY COMMISSION**

Under Article IV, Section 17, of the Texas Constitution, the President Pro Tempore of the Texas Senate serves as Governor at any time when the Governor and Lieutenant Governor are absent from the state. When serving as the Governor, the President Pro Tempore "exercise[s] the powers and authority appertaining to the office of Governor until the Governor or Lieutenant Governor reassumes those powers and duties." Senator Leticia Van de Putte, who was elected as Senate President Pro Tempore by her colleagues on January 8, 2013, served as Governor on May 4, 2013.

As part of her official acts, she created a Texas Vexillology Commission by appointment of four commissioners. As required by Article IV, Section 20, she issued each member a commission of office that was sealed with the state seal. After receiving their commissions and executing their oaths of office, the commissioners adopted the report printed in this issue. The commission ceased operations with the sine die adjournment of the 81st Legislature's regular session.

## SCHOLARLY CORRESPONDENCE

In the 81st Legislature (2009), Rep. Brandon Creighton of Montgomery County introduced House Bill 1624 to establish a statewide recognition day in honor of Charles Stewart, citing in part the fact that Stewart "is credited as the designer of the Lone Star flag used in Texas today." The following correspondence was provided to the committee during its consideration of the bill, which died without a vote on the floor of the House.

McMURRAY UNIVERSITY  
Abilene, Texas, April 9, 2009

HON. BRANDON CREIGHTON

Texas House of Representatives, Austin, Texas.

DEAR REPRESENTATIVE CREIGHTON: I urge the committee on Culture, Recreation and Tourism to take no action leading to passage of House Bill 1624 when it is considered on April 14, 2009. There is significant controversy over the veracity of claims made on behalf of Charles Stewart regarding his alleged creation of the Lone Star Flag and his reputed position as first secretary of state of the Republic of Texas. Any recognition of Mr. Stewart, in my opinion, would be inappropriate while the historical facts are still very much in question.

I have a deep interest in this matter for several reasons. I was historian of the Historic Flags of Texas Project, which as you may recall involved documenting and conserving the historic flag collection of the Texas State Library and Archives under the aegis of the Texas Historical Commission. I then was curator for the Museum of Fine Arts Houston of the 2002 exhibition *Texas Flags 1838-1941*. I am author of the award-winning book *Texas Flags* (Texas A. & M. Press, 2001), which many historians consider to be the definitive scholarly work on the history of flags in Texas.

But it is as an educator that I am most concerned. A large portion of my academic duties involves preparing students to teach history in the Texas public schools. I try to instill in my them a sense of duty to be impartial and accurate in what they teach. Honoring Charles Stewart in any way before the facts are established means succumbing to the same old boosterism that used to plague the teaching of history in this state. Please do not send the wrong message to my students by advancing this bill.

Sincerely,

ROBERT MABERRY JR., PH.D., *Assistant Professor of History (designate)*

FLAG RESEARCH CENTER  
Winchester, Mass., May 19, 2009

Mr. CHARLES A. SPAIN, JR.

Houston, Texas.

DEAR MR. SPAIN: I am responding to your inquiry of 15 April concerning the issue of the authenticity of the claim that the designer of the second national flag of the Republic of Texas (the Lone Star flag) was Charles Stewart. I am glad to provide you with my position on this important issue. In particular I want to take the opportunity to repudiate the statement I made when authoring *The Flag Book of the United States*, published in 1970 and republished with modifications in 1975. My statement, made on page 207, read "The new design, the idea of Dr. Charles B. Stewart...".

I cannot recall which book served as the source for my claim concerning the flag. In any event I have since been convinced by documentary evidence that the claim and, therefore, my reliance on it were in error.

The issue is important because of the significance in Texas history of the Lone Star flag. School children, those concerned with flag history (vexillologists), members of the Texas legislature and other branches of the Texas government are among the many who are concerned with the importance of the claim.

As Director of the Flag Research Center, internationally recognized as the oldest and largest institution in the world devoted exclusively to research and publication concerning flags, I am committed to presenting accurate and thorough information in this and similar circumstances.

I have now had a chance to read the information on the question of the identification of the individual responsible for the design of the Lone Star flag. Several individuals have put forth claims on the subject, but in my considered opinion the available documentation does not adequately and decisively provide an answer to the question of the authorship of the flag. Considering the importance of the issue it would be a dereliction of duty to claim the honor for one person or another simply because his name has been associated with the authorship of the flag.

It is possible, of course, that at some point in the future evidence may become available that will allow for a definitive judgment. In the meantime I would strongly counsel against endorsing any claim. Moreover, aware as I am of the efforts that have been made to credit Stewart with the designing of the flag, I wish to record my strong belief that those claims appear to be no more than partisan attempts to present a "favorite son" candidate for the honor.

I hope this information is of some value for you.

Sincerely,

WHITNEY SMITH JR., PH.D., *Executive Director*

The National  
Standard

No. 6  
Spring-Summer 2014

Bulletin of the  
Vexillological  
Association of the  
State of Texas